Nonequilibrium Fluctuations, Traveling Waves, and Instabilities in Active Membranes

Sriram Ramaswamy,1 John Toner,2 and Jacques Prost3

1Centre for Condensed Matter Theory, Department of Physics, Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore 560 012 India
2Material Science Institute, Institute of Theoretical Science, and Department of Physics, University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon 97403-5203
3Institut Curie, Section de Recherche, 26 rue d’Ulm, 75231 Paris Cedex 05, France
(Received 1 October 1999)

The functioning of active proteins in energy-dissipating processes, such as ion transport, protein translocation, and biopolymer synthesis, generates forces on the membranes of the living cell and its organelles [1,2]. As the active proteins diffuse around in the membrane, the resulting fluctuations in this force provide a nonthermal source of noise for shape fluctuations of the membrane. The membranes of a living cell are therefore nonequilibrium or active membranes. Although such active, nonequilibrium processes are abundant in biological membranes, physicists have focused mainly—with considerable success [3,4]—on the statistical mechanics of membranes at thermal equilibrium. There are however reasons [5,6] to suspect that nonequilibrium processes are at work even in red-blood-cell flicker, traditionally explained as thermal equilibrium shape fluctuations [7]. The predictions [8,9] of fluctuation enhancement in active membranes and the micropipette experiments [10] on membranes laden with the photosensitive proton pump bacteriorhodopsin (bR) are further motivation for our studies.

In this Letter, we consider the statistical mechanics and dynamics of a fluid membrane containing a distribution of identical, active pumps free to move in the plane of the membrane. By “pump” we mean a membrane-spanning protein which, when supplied with energy, transfers material (and thus exerts a force on the membrane) in one direction only. This ignores the complexities of some real pumps but is a good description of bR. By convention, we shall term the end towards which the force acts as the head of the pump, and the other end its tail. We shall call a protein a “+ pump” (“− pump”) if the vector from its tail to its head points parallel to (antiparallel to) a fixed outward normal of the membrane. Flips from + to −, prohibitively slow in any real system, are forbidden in our treatment. A membrane will be termed “balanced” (“unbalanced”) if the numbers of + and − pumps are equal (unequal). The unidirectional pumping action means that a given pump knows up from down. In general, therefore, (i) a pump of a given sign will favor one sign of the local mean curvature $H$ of the membrane over the other (Fig. 1), and (ii) its pumping activity will depend on $H$. Incorporating these effects distinguishes the present work from [8,9].

Here is a summary of our main results: (i) An active membrane can be either linearly stable or linearly unstable against undulation and pump aggregation, depending on the structural and functional asymmetries mentioned in the previous paragraph. (ii) In the stable case, for plausible values of the physical parameters a balanced active membrane has, over an appreciable intermediate range of wave numbers $k$, a height variance of the order of wave numbers $k$, a height variance $\langle |h_k|^2 \rangle \propto 1/k^4$, with a coefficient independent of the concentration of pumps. These are truly nonequilibrium fluctuations, with a strength depending on kinetic coefficients: $\langle |h_k|^2 \rangle$ is proportional to the permeability of the membrane. This is broadly consistent with the observations of [10]. (iii) For a stable membrane, the long wavelength disturbances travel as nondispersive waves, i.e., waves with a speed independent of wave vector $k$. The wave speed $c$ is set by the pump activity and independent of the membrane elasticity. (iv) In this longest wavelength regime, the height variance is much smaller, as $k \to 0$, than in the equilibrium case; specifically $\langle |h_k|^2 \rangle \approx \frac{1}{k^2}$ as $k \to 0$. This result depends on the effect of nonlinearities, which also determine the final state of the system [11,12] in the unstable case.

We now construct our model and derive the results stated above. We characterize the active membrane by

FIG. 1. Asymmetric proteins (the black wedges) imbedded in a fluid membrane are drawn to regions with curvature adapted to the protein shape.
its mean curvature $H$ and the areal concentrations $\nu_\pm$ of + and − pumps. In a Monge description $H = -\nabla^2 h$ and $\nu_\pm = n_\pm / \sqrt{1 + (\nabla h)^2}$, where $h(x,t)$ is the height of the membrane at time $t$ above point $x$ on a two-dimensional reference plane, and $n_\pm(x,t)$ are the projections of the pump concentrations onto the plane. It is useful to distinguish the protein concentration

$$n(x,t) \equiv n_+(x,t) + n_-(x,t)$$

and the signed protein density

$$m(x,t) \equiv n_+(x,t) - n_-(x,t)$$

with averages $m_0$ and $n_0$, respectively. For convenience, we shall work with

$$\psi \equiv \frac{m}{n_0}, \quad \phi \equiv \frac{n}{n_0}, \quad \psi_0 \equiv m_0/n_0.$$  (3)

We begin with a membrane at thermal equilibrium at temperature $T = T_0^{-1}$, where the proteins are present but not activated. The probability of a configuration $\{h(x), \psi(x)\}$ is $\propto \exp(-\beta E)$ with a Hamiltonian [13]

$$E[h, \psi] = \frac{1}{2} \int d^2 x \left[ \kappa (\nabla^2 h)^2 + \sigma (\nabla h)^2 \right]$$

$$+ A(\psi - \psi_0)^2 - 2\kappa \bar{H} \psi \nabla^2 h]$$

(4)

to bilinear order in the variables involved. $E$ contains a bending energy [3] with a rigidity $\kappa$, a surface tension $\sigma$, a compression energy for the signed protein density, with osmotic modulus

$$A \sim T n_0$$

(5)

for $n_0 \rightarrow 0$, and a coupling $\bar{H}$ which determines the local spontaneous curvature induced [14] by the presence of a protein (Fig. 1). This last term is one of the consequences of the directionality of the pumps, and can be attributed to a head-tail size difference of magnitude

$$\ell_1 \equiv \frac{\bar{H}}{n_0}.$$  (6)

We expect $\ell_1$ to be independent of $n_0$ for $n_0 \rightarrow 0$.

We now explain why (4) ignores the protein concentration field $\phi$. Minimizing (4) tells us that in thermal equilibrium a membrane with a net imbalance $\psi_0$ of pumps will develop a spontaneous curvature

$$H_0 = (\nabla^2 h)_{minE} = \frac{\bar{H}}{1 - \kappa \bar{H}^2/\psi_0}.$$  (7)

Many experiments on the physics of membranes are carried out on giant vesicles (size $\geq 20 \mu m$), for which the mean curvature and hence, from (7), $\psi_0$ are negligibly small. Accordingly, we shall work at $\psi_0 = 0$ for much of this paper. In this limit, the symmetry $h \rightarrow -h$, $\psi \rightarrow -\psi$ (equivalently $\epsilon \rightarrow -\epsilon$ for each pump of sign $\epsilon = \pm$) rules out any bilinear coupling $\psi \phi$ in (4) for $\psi_0 = 0$. Thus, in a linearized treatment of a balanced membrane, $\phi$ decouples from $h$ and $\psi$. In addition, for $\psi_0 = 0$, the mean normal drift speed of the membrane in the active state is zero. Towards the end of this paper we shall present some important results for $\psi_0 \neq 0$.

Equation (4) implies the equilibrium height variance

$$\langle |h_k|^2 \rangle = \frac{T}{\sigma k^2 + \kappa_{eff} k^4}$$

(8)

at wave vector $k$, with an effective rigidity

$$\kappa_{eff} = \kappa - \frac{(\kappa \bar{H})^2}{A}$$

(9)

independent of $\text{sgn}(\bar{H})$. The dynamics of small fluctuations is also determined by $\kappa_{eff}$. We shall assume that $\bar{H}$ is small enough to keep $\kappa_{eff} > 0$ [15], so that the presence of the inactive but shape-asymmetric proteins merely shifts the value of the bending rigidity.

In the active state (e.g., when the bR in the experiments of [10] is illuminated with green light) even static quantities such as $\langle |h_k|^2 \rangle$ must be determined from the dynamical properties of the system. To this end, let us assemble the ingredients for the equations of motion, to leading orders in a gradient expansion, of a membrane with active proteins. We continue to work at $\psi_0 = 0$.

An isolated active pump with sign $\epsilon = \pm$ exerts a force $\epsilon F_a$ normal to the membrane, if the local mean curvature $H = 0$. If $H \neq 0$, the symmetry $h \rightarrow -h$, $\epsilon \rightarrow -\epsilon$ permits an additional contribution $[16] \ell_2 H F_a$ to the force, where $\ell_2$, whose sign is not fixed by symmetry, is a length characterizing the sensitivity of the pumping mechanism to the bending of the membrane. The force arising from the activity of a distribution of + and − pumps with intrinsic concentrations $\nu_\pm$, together with the elastic force $f_{el}$ arising from (4), give rise via permeative flow with kinetic coefficient $\mu_p$ [17] to a normal velocity

$$v_n = \mu_p \left( (\nu_+ - \nu_-) + (\nu_+ + \nu_-) \ell_2 H \right. \right.$$  

$$\left. + O(\nu_+ - \nu_-)^3 F_a - \mu_p \ell_2 f_{el} \right.$$  

(10)

where the $O(\nu_+ - \nu_-)^3$ (and higher odd order) terms arise only if the presence of a given pump affects the activity of other pumps.

Projecting (10) normal to the reference horizontal plane [18], defining the natural velocity scale

$$v_0 = \mu_p F_a n_0 > 0,$$  (11)

adding the contribution $v_{hyd}$ due to hydrodynamic flow [7,19] and expanding in powers of $\nabla h$, we obtain

$$\frac{\partial h}{\partial t} = v_0 (\psi + \ell_2 \phi \nabla^2 h + O(\psi^3, \psi^3(\nabla h)^2))$$

$$- \mu_p \delta E/\delta h + v_{hyd} + f_h$$

$$= v_0 (\psi + \ell_2 \nabla^2 h + v_{hyd}$$

$$- \mu_p (-\sigma \nabla^2 h + \kappa \nabla^4 h - \kappa \bar{H} \nabla^2 \psi) + f_h.$$  (12)
Here the Gaussian zero-mean noise $f_h$ has variance $[9,20]$
$2T[\mu_p + (1/4\eta q)^{-1}]$ at wave number $q$, and

$$v_{\text{hydr}} = -\int \frac{d^2 q}{(2\pi)^2} e^{i q \cdot x} \frac{1}{4\eta q} \frac{\delta E}{\delta h_q(t)},$$  \hspace{1cm} (13)

where $h_q(t)$ is the spatially Fourier-transformed height field and $\eta$ the solvent viscosity. The signed protein density obeys the conservation law \[21\]

$$\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial t} = v_0 \nabla \cdot \left( \frac{\psi^2 \nabla \psi}{1 + (\nabla \psi)^2} \right) + \Lambda \nabla^2 \delta E/\delta \psi + \nabla \cdot f_\psi$$

$$\approx \Lambda A \nabla^2 \psi - \Lambda \kappa \hat{H} \nabla^4 h + \nabla \cdot f_\psi,$$  \hspace{1cm} (14)

where the $v_0$ term comes from projecting (10) parallel to the reference plane, $\Lambda$ is the mobility of the pumps, and $f_\psi$ is a spatiotemporally white, isotropic, vector thermal noise with variance $2T\Lambda$. Since the dissipative processes that gave rise to $f_h$ and $f_\psi$ are still present, we ignore for simplicity possible additional, pumping-dependent bare noise sources. In both (12) and (14), the first equality is valid for a general energy function $E$ including $\phi \psi$ couplings, while the second (approximate) equality applies only to a strictly linearized treatment at $\psi_0 = 0$ with $\phi = 1$. Equations (12) and (14) define our model.

Before using these equations, it is crucial to note that if $\ell_2$ or $\hat{H}$ is sufficiently large and negative, then (12) and (14) predict that a flat membrane with a statistically uniform distribution of $+\text{ and }-\text{ pumps}$ is linearly unstable, even if $\kappa_{\text{eff}} > 0$ [see Eq. (9)], with perturbations growing at a rate proportional to $k^2$ at small wave number $k$. To see this physically (Fig. 2), imagine a region of excess active $+\text{ pumps}$ surrounded by a statistically uniform $-\text{ mixture}$, in an initially flat membrane. Pumping will pull the $+\text{ region}$ ahead of its surroundings leading to mean curvature $\hat{H} = -\nabla^2 h$ around the $+\text{ pump}$. This can lead to an instability in two ways: (i) If $\hat{H} < 0$, this will attract more $+\text{ pumps}$. (ii) If $\ell_2 < 0$, the activity of the $+\text{ pumps}$ in the region is enhanced. Such physical mechanisms could well be involved in processes where cell membranes undergo large deformations. Well beyond the onset of these instabilities, nonlinearities will determine the ultimate fate of the membrane [11,12,22].

For the remainder of this paper, we assume parameter values corresponding to a \textit{linearly stable} active membrane. The two eigenmodes for disturbances at small wave number $k$ are diffusive if $v_0\ell_1$, $v_0\ell_2$ are small compared to the pump diffusivity $\Lambda A$, and propagative but highly dispersive (wave speed $\sim k$) if $v_0$ is large enough.

More important is the height variance $\langle |h_k|^2 \rangle$ at wave number $k$, which is obtained by linearizing and Fourier transforming (12) and (14) in space and time, solving for $h_{k,\omega}$ and $\psi_{k,\omega}$ at wave vector $k$ and frequency $\omega$, using the statistical properties of the noise sources $f_h$ and $f_\psi$ to obtain $\langle |h_{k,\omega}|^2 \rangle$, and integrating over $\omega$.

For $k$ much smaller than the lesser of

$$k_{\text{max}} \equiv \frac{4\eta v_0 \hat{H}}{A} \quad \text{and} \quad k_P \equiv \frac{4\eta D_\phi}{\kappa},$$  \hspace{1cm} (15)

setting the tension $\sigma = 0$, we find from (12) and (14) that

$$\langle |h_k|^2 \rangle \approx \frac{T}{F_\phi n_0 \ell_k^2 + \kappa_{\text{eff}} k^4} + \frac{\mu_p F_a}{D_\phi} \frac{\ell}{k^4},$$  \hspace{1cm} (16)

where we have defined $\ell \equiv \ell_2 + \frac{\kappa_{\text{eff}}}{\kappa} \ell_1$. The thermal wandering of the membrane is thus \textit{suppressed} by a pumping-induced tension $F_a n_0 \ell$, but a novel nonequilibrium contribution to the height fluctuations now appears, mimicking a zero-tension equilibrium membrane. Note that the coupling $\ell$ of the pumps to the curvature is crucial here: for $\ell = 0$ we would find $k^{-5}$ behavior as in \[8\]. For $n_0 \to 0$, the diffusivity $D_\phi \equiv \Lambda A$ of the pumps approaches that of an isolated pump and is hence nonzero and, from (5) and (6), the length $\ell \approx \ell_2 + (\kappa/T) \ell_1$. The coefficient of $k^{-4}$ in (16) is thus independent of $n_0$ for small $n_0$.

If the tension is nonzero, the behavior in (16) is cut off for $k$ less than

$$k_{\text{min}} \equiv \frac{\sigma A}{4\eta v_0 \kappa \hat{H}} = \frac{\sigma}{\kappa k_{\text{max}}},$$  \hspace{1cm} (17)

As a consequence, the excess area \[23\]

$$\alpha = \frac{1}{2} \langle (\nabla h)^2 \rangle \approx \frac{\mu_p F_a}{D_\phi} \ln \frac{k_{\text{max}}}{k_{\text{min}}},$$  \hspace{1cm} (18)
can be seen to depend only logarithmically on the protein density $n_0$. Moreover, increasing the solvent viscosity should decrease $\mu_p$ while leaving $D_\phi$ unaffected, and should thus decrease $\alpha$. These predictions of (18) are consistent with the experiments of [10]. However, not enough is known about the values of parameters such as $\mu_p$, $F_a$, and $\ell$ to make a detailed comparison. If instead $D_\phi$ is decreased, $\langle \delta h^2 \rangle$ should increase. Such predictions of the dependence of static correlations on kinetic quantities allow clear tests of our model and of the truly nonequilibrium nature of the fluctuations.

We turn finally to the wavelike modes mentioned at the start of the paper. A net excess of pumps of one sign ($\psi_0 \neq 0$) would yield a term $v_0\psi_0^2 \nabla^2 h$ in the linearized (14). With (12) this would lead to propagating waves with a speed $v_0\psi_0 = \mu_p F_a m_0$. Even for $\psi_0 = 0$, the presence of fluctuations means that $(\psi^2) \neq 0$. Hence, improving upon our strictly linearized treatment by letting $\psi^2 \to (\psi^2)$ in (14) leads to a prediction of waves with speed $c = v_0(\psi^2)^{1/2} = \mu_p F_a(m^2)^{1/2}$, and to a nonequilibrium height variance $\langle \delta h^2 \rangle \sim (\mu_p v_0^2 T) / (v_0\ell^2 + D_\phi) c^2 k^2$. It is important to note that these waves appear only for wave vectors $k < k_{\text{fluc}} \equiv \sqrt{v_0(\psi^2)/D_\phi \ell^2}$; for $k > k_{\text{fluc}}$ our earlier linearized results apply. Hence, for a system with small fluctuations $(\psi^2)$, the linearized results (16) and (18) could well hold at the experimental wave numbers $k$.

In any case, for $\psi_0 \neq 0$, a complete analysis requires, even at a linearized level, the inclusion of fluctuations in the protein density $n$. Replacing $\psi^2$ by its average, too, is simply a first step in a complete treatment of nonlinear fluctuation effects. A detailed consideration of all such effects will appear elsewhere [22].

We close by summarizing this work. Starting with a natural model of a membrane with active proteins, we show that such a membrane can be linearly stable or unstable to small perturbations in its shape and the distribution of proteins. In the stable case, we show that the $k^{-4}$ dependence of the height fluctuations can mimic that of an equilibrium membrane, but with an enhanced temperature, consistent with the observations of [10]. Further experiments, in particular, on the dependence of the height variance on the protein diffusivity, will provide more stringent tests of our predictions. We are currently in the process of studying the effects of nonlinearities on the scaling of correlation functions in the stable case and on the growth in the unstable case [11,12,22].

We thank F. Jülicher, P.B.S. Kumar, R. Nityananda, A. Pande, R. Pandit, and M. Rao for valuable discussions, the U.S. NSF (Grant No. DMR-9634596) for financial support, and the Aspen Center for Physics and the Raman Research Institute for their hospitality.